

**Graduate Council Minutes
October 31, 2017
Main Campus, Student Union, Room 2582**

Present: Wissam AbouAlaiwi, Brian Ashburner, Timothy Brakel, Tomer Avidor-Reiss, Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Frank Calzonetti, Huey-Shys Chen, Michael Dowd, Viviana Ferreira, Bashar Gammoh, Rafael Garcia-Mata, Mitchell Haines (GSA), Jason Huntley, Edward Janak, Andrea Kalinoski, Jyl Matson, Marcia McInerney, Daryl Moorhead, Douglas Nims, Penny Poplin Gosetti, Constance Schall, Barry Scheuermann, Beth Schlemper, Rebecca Schneider, Zahoor Shah, Susan Sochacki, Megan Stewart, Amy Thompson, Jerry Van Hoy.

Absent: Ben Davis, Junghwan Kim, Joseph Margiotta, Lori Pakulski, Jennifer Reynolds, Jason Stumbo, Kandace Williams.

Excused: Hassan Hassab-Elnaby, Mohamed Samir Hefzy, Song-Tao Liu, Alisa Nammavong (GSA), Geoffrey Rapp, Barbara Schneider, Ozcan Sezer.

Guests: William Ayres.

Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes

The meeting was called to order and the roll called. The Minutes of the Graduate Council meetings of September 5, 2017 and September 17, 2017 were approved.

Executive Reports

Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council

On behalf of Graduate Council, Chair, Dr. Andrea Kalinoski reported that at its meeting on October 24, the GCEC discussed:

- The need for a policy at the College level for syllabi on cross-listed graduate courses (i.e. 6000/8000 level). HLC requires the syllabus to distinguish the various levels of learning. Dr. Cyndee Gruden will discuss further.
- The Process for New Graduate Program Development. Dr. Cyndee Gruden, Associate Dean COGS will provide these guidelines and they will be available on the COGS website.
- TOEFL requirements -Should countries who have English listed as the official language be updated? New countries update to be discussed by Dean Bryant-Friedrich.
- Two new Graduate Program Presentations to GC on Nov. 15th:
 1. Masters in Athletic Training program
 2. Executive Master of Sales Leadership (EMSL)
- Policy Review and Discussion: Graduate Student Leave of Absence (3364-77-04) and Graduate Student Enrollment Status (3364-77-05)

Report of the Graduate Student Association

Mr. Mitch Haines, President of the Graduate Student Association (GSA) reported:

- GSA Graduate Student Research Award deadline is November 17, 2017. Please pass this opportunity along to your students. The application is on the GSA and COGS website.

- The GSA is sponsoring the Biological Graduate Research Symposium, which is scheduled on November 3, 2017.
- The next GSA General Assembly meeting is in HEB 105 (Health Science Campus) on November 14, 2017.
- GSA is sponsoring a mixer for all graduate students at Caper's Pizza Bar on November 9, 2017.
- Currently working with COGS to develop graduate student professional development workshops.

Report of the Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dr. Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Dean of the College of Graduate Studies provided the following updates beginning with Strategic Planning: Student Success (Part A). She discussed her PowerPoint presentation titled "Graduate Student Success" that she also presented to Academic Leadership Team on September 28, 2017.

o *Strategic Planning: Student Success (Part A)*

➤ **Graduation Rates MS/PhD levels:**

MS

One year retention rate	Two year graduation rate	Three year graduation rate	Four year graduation rate	Five year graduation rate
78.3%	66.0%	81.4%	80.9%	85.1%

PhD

One year retention rate	Five year graduation rate	Six year graduation rate	Seven year graduation rate
89.9%	46.6%	65.2%	69.2%

Masters level data goes back five years and is based on full-time students enrolled in the fall of each academic year. Year three is outlined in the Strategic Plan. Although we are already exceeding 80%, it is important to pay attention to this number. Unfortunately, some of the data the university uses is lacking in reliability.

Ph.D. one-year retention rate is 89.9%. These numbers are much more reliable. The five-year graduation rate is not necessarily a good indicator, as many disciplines do not graduate their students in five years as a national average. It would be better to align this number to metrics around the country.

Discussion:

Dr. Andrea Kalinoski pointed out that students may not finish a Ph.D. but complete a master's instead.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich agreed that their numbers are lost from the Ph.D. cohort.

Dr. Mike Dowd inquired whether graduation numbers nationally were available to see how UT compares.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich responded that UT's one-year retention rate is normal, but that she did not know how we compared otherwise. Students tend to be retained during the time when they are taking coursework but may drop out after taking the qualifying exam.

Dr. Connie Schall stated that external statistics of passing qualifying exams is more telling.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich replied that she would seek data, particularly at 2 -3 years.

Dr. Jason Huntley mentioned that COGS should receive notification of the status of students' qualifying examinations.

Dr. Cyndee Gruden noted that passing the qualifying examination is included on the requirement checklist, but that COGS is not notified at the time of the exam. Students take exams at different times.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich noted that doctoral students should be making their milestones.

Dr. Huntley questioned whether low passage rates in qualifying exams would send a red flag causing COGS to look at it.

Dr. Viviana Ferreira noted that the College of Medicine and Life Sciences has a process.

Dr. Jerry Van Hoy asked how academic years were counted and whether it included summer.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich responded that it depends on when they apply for admission. While many programs start in the fall, others including some masters programs may start year-round.

Dr. Bashar Gammoh asked if most PhD programs average a five-year graduate rate.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich replied that there are many factors contributing to success such as non-financial family support, motivation and accommodation of work obligations. They often need to support families and have work obligations outside of academics. I want to figure out how to help motivationally. Financial support is part of that.

Dr. Van Hoy noted that deadlines are motivators.

Dr. Huntley noted that there are timeline requirements for master's (6 years) and doctoral degrees (7 years).

Dr. Penny Poplin Gosetti noted that it could be difficult for students working full time to meet these deadlines.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich cautioned against setting limits on part time students who could switch between full-time and part-time.

Dr. Huntley stated that programs that have a time requirement should be identified so that it helps graduation numbers.

➤ Factors Contributing to Success –Ph.D.

- SELECTION
- MENTORING
- FINANCIAL SUPPORT
- PROGRAM ENVIRONMENT
- RESEARCH MODE OF THE FIELD
- PROCESSES AND PROCEDURES

- SELECTION

Dean Bryant-Friedrich stated the level of selectivity allowed is a major factor. Some programs have the ability to be more selective while others cannot.

Dr. Bashar Gammoh noted that the advisor is major factor contributing to a Ph.D. student's success.

- MENTORING

Dean Bryant-Friedrich stressed that graduate students need mentoring. They expect and need financial support if they are full time. They are usually committed full-time. She supports that. However, they do need stipends they can live on.

- FINANCIAL SUPPORT

- COMPETITIVE
- MORE OPTIONS FOR FUNDING (I.E. HIGH STIPEND, LOW STIPEND + HEALTH INSURANCE, TUITION ONLY, PARTIAL TUITION)
- PRIORITIZE FUNDING BASED ON PROGRAM NEED.
- LEVERAGE RESOURCES. E.G., WHERE RESEARCH FUNDING IS AVAILABLE, HELP NEW FACULTY ESTABLISH A RESEARCH GROUP (PRODUCTIVITY MEASURE).
- PROMEDICA FUNDS FOR HEALTH INSURANCE AND BENEFITS (COMLS)

Dean Bryant-Friedrich indicated that financial support packages would be discussed later.

Dr. Mike Dowd asked whether COGS receives the graduate school application fees.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich responded that it goes to the central fund.

Dr. Mike Dowd stated that a fee discourages applications. Additionally, if COGS were to receive the fees, it could be used to enhance graduate studies.

Dr. Tomer Avidor-Reiss asked Dean Bryant-Friedrich to consider that although doctoral students receive stipends during fall and spring semesters, summer support is important too.

- PROGRAM ENVIRONMENT

Students who feel they are in the crosswinds of politics can affect how they feel about the program.

Two kinds of delays, the advisor and the students.

Appropriate research scope (creep, neglect and meanness). Creep is an engineering term referring to when the scope of a project changes or grows. May see this, particularly if the student is very good. Meanness could be department politics.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich asked if there is sense that graduate students feel neglected.

Some have commented in the past.

Not monitoring students as a group.

Students needs support. They should seek out support of the department if the advisor is not clear enough.

Sometimes student/faculty pairings may not be best.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich asked if colleges have mechanisms for changing research advisors and if students take advantage of this option.

Council responded mostly 'yes' but added that students may be apprehensive to initiate a change of advisor.

- RESEARCH MODE OF THE FIELD

Dean Bryant-Friedrich stressed that a research mode supported by infrastructure progress flows, but it takes longer without it.

- PROCESS AND PROCEDURES

Dean Bryant-Friedrich stressed that processes and procedures are all of our responsibilities because students need a plan.

Dr. Mike Dowd suggested that COGS look at processes that get in the way of students graduating.

Students are concerned about career after Ph.D.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich asked Council for their input how can time to degree and success be improved for graduate students'?

Summer only MS/MA programs with financial support?

Dr. David Jex said there are some music programs that are summer only ~3 summers.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich asked if it is valuable to provide summer only support.

Dr. Penny Poplin Gosetti thought this would be good for higher education, but noted that it may impact financial aid. Students/teachers could attend full-time in the summer.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich asked if faculty would be interested in teaching full-time program during the summer.

There was some support from Council.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich asked for input on appropriate advising. What is this and how do we expect investigators to provide. This can be discussed further during the Strategic Planning discussion process.

Protect students from department politics.

High quality, challenging graduate course offerings.

Recruiting talented students should be the top priority in the Strategic Plan. What is the best way and what is a talented student?

Dr. Lori Pakulski noted that in her college, Health and Human Services, many Michigan resident students are offered a tuition package and they still do not come. Even with the Michigan Initiative providing out-of-state support, they still lost about 15 top-notch students after they accepted, when they realized what it cost them financially.

Dr. Jason Huntley noted in comparison to our peer institutions, we are not offering paid healthcare. Some institutions do recruiting weekends, and meet potential students on 1:1 basis.

They do short research presentations and interview faculty and vice versa. If you get prospective students involved early, they would be more likely to stay involved.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich asked if GRE scores for Ph.D. students are measure of talent.

Dr. Susan Sochacki did not think it was a successful measure. It may reveal proficiency of language perhaps, but not a correlation to success or talent.

Dr. Mike Dowd said that indicates success at the undergraduate level.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich asked how we should measure that we are recruiting committed students.

Some international students may want to extend their stay for immigration reasons. It is hard to tell them to leave if their concerns are an issue. We have a high number of students from areas where there are issues.

Dr. Marcia McInerney gave an example of a student who had finished the Ph.D., returned to Iraq, and then accepted a post doc position at Stanford. Iraq would not let him go to accept the position because he had to pay them back.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich stated a pathway to success is critical for graduate students and that professional development helps prepare them to be work ready.

Dr. Bashar Gammoh noted that success is linked to motivation to complete the degree and to move on into their field.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich inquired about whether colleges and program provide peer mentoring.

Dr. Susan Sochacki replied there is some programs.

Mr. Mitch Haines (GSA) noted that first-year students are mentored by second-year students in the Physician Assistant program and that there is an Academic Enrichment Center in the College of Medicine and Life Sciences.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich stated that there are various pathways to degree completion and questioned how this can accomplished in different ways, while fostering career progression, and transferring in credits?

Service on dissertation committees has become a workload issue.

Dr. Megan Stewart noted that when asked to serve on thesis committees, it is frequently on short notice. It is not clear if this results from the student or the advisor.

Dr. Tomer Avidor-Reiss expressed the importance of selecting a thesis committee in a timely manner. There is also a need to provide support to monitor such functionalities.

Summer provides the opportunity to work and meet with students. He questioned whether other institutions have found ways to incentivize faculty.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich replied that colleges say it is part of workload and that there are resource issues. She noted that program capacity is also a part of the consideration.

Dr. Lori Pakulski stated that many faculty feel their programs are at capacity with faculty workload. A lack of resources requires creativity.

Even though we meet most or all metrics, there is no incentive or reward; we are just told we have to do more.

Dr. Mike Dowd asked Dean Bryant-Friedrich to considering discussing with the Deans and for Dr. Bill Ayres to discuss with the Provost. He noted that recognition of committee work has eroded over past decade and that it should equal a course reduction. Faculty are doing more with less. If the university wants to build its reputation, it needs to do that with graduate education, not undergraduate education. It is through graduate programs, which are the intellectual legacy of this university.

Vice Provost Bill Ayres replied that there is an opportunity to address such issues as the Deans have been asked by Provost to develop or update guidelines for determining workloads in the colleges. They are not likely to be uniform. This is occurring now. He expressed his hope that the Deans would have conversations in within the colleges. Faculty should work with deans to develop robust workload guidelines.

Dr. Mike Dowd said this was welcome news. If the Provost's office has changed its financial structure to allow deans to accommodate faculty workload but has no funding, it becomes a self-cannibalizing budget. Resources have to come from somewhere else. The Provost's office should be willing to provide some funding to support this important consideration. This is above and beyond teaching workload only.

Vice Provost Bill Ayres stated that if a college has a well thought out plan, he will do all he can to give it this consideration.

Dr. Barbara Schneider commented that results could not be to replace tenure-track faculty with lecturers.

Dr. Tomer Avidor-Reiss stated that faculty are getting mixed messages. Faculty are bringing in money but cannot teach more than one course. He pointed out that he has a class with 47 students. The more students added means they get less time and attention. There is no one to replace the faculty.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich agreed to the importance of this matter and said she would have a hearty discussion with Deans and that Vice Provost Bill Ayres would take to the Provost.

Dr. Jason Huntley stated that successful outcomes from Strategic Planning requires that everyone be committed. Everyone has to have skin in the game.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich stated that she is hearing the faculty's concerns for mentor training.

➤ **How can Student Recruitment, Timely Registration, and the Onboarding Process be Improved for Graduate Students?**

Dean Bryant-Friedrich expressed COGS desire to help facilitate the processes and make sure you are sending out correct information. She stated that she would like to develop an alumni board. She asked Council 'What can we do better?'.

Dr. Tomer Avidor-Reiss said faculty experience difficulty getting application information from the server. Dr. Bashar Gammoh noted there is not standardization of application information, thus requiring faculty and committees to look deeper. BG – no standardization.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich stated she would like to have GA budgeting done in December so that programs can make their funding decisions early.

• **STUDENT RECRUITMENT**

Dean Bryant-Friedrich stated that COGS participates in fairs by providing materials and coordinating with other programs. The programs need training in recruiting as they are in the position to know who the best students are. Regarding fellowships, we are looking at expanding the number we have. COGS is also surveying current students to learn how they learned about UT.

TOEFL Requirements for COGS

Dean Bryant-Friedrich reported that in keeping in alignment with many universities that have expanded countries where the TOEFL is not required, we are also looking at not requiring the TOEFL from these countries. Many of these countries often indicate that English is their first language. Graduate school at UT uses the TOEFL and IELTS as a measure of English as second language.

Anguilla
Antigua and Barbuda
Australia
The Bahamas
Barbados
Belize
Bermuda
Botswana
British Virgin Islands
Cameroon
Canada
Cayman Islands
Christmas Island
Cook Islands
Dominica
Fiji
The Gambia
Ghana
Grenada
Guam
Guernsey
Guyana
Ireland

Jamaica
Jersey
Kenya
Kiribati
Lesotho
Liberia
Malawi
Micronesia
Montserrat
Namibia
New Zealand
Nigeria
Niue
Norfolk Island
Northern Mariana Islands
Philippines
Pitcairn Islands
Rwanda
Saint Helena
Saint Kitts and Nevis
Saint Lucia
Saint Vincent
Sierra Leone
Saint Maarten
Solomon Islands
South Africa
South Sudan
Sudan
Tonga
Trinidad and Tobago
Uganda
United Kingdom
Virgin Islands
Zambia

Dr. Wissam Abou-Alaiwi pointed out that the American University of Beirut's official language is English.

Dr. Mike Dowd noted that many graduate students in Economics are from Africa and Europe and even though English is not their first language, they speak and write well. The TOEFL is a costly nuisance for the students. He liked the idea of considering where applicants are coming from, as it would help reduce their costs.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich noted the five countries for which we currently do not require the TOEFL. Australia, Canada (all provinces except Quebec), New Zealand, United Kingdom and Ireland.

Dr. Bashar Gammoh said that either the TOEFL or the university has to be looked at and perhaps account for a variable interaction.

Dr. Marcia McInerney noted that students sometimes have exceptional TOEFL scores but cannot pass the English language screening test when they arrive at UT.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich explained that if we are going to consider expand upon accepting students from countries where English is not the first language, without taking TOEFL, we need a process that we are confident with so that students are successful in our programs without being hindered by language deficiencies. If Council agrees, COGS can investigate a proper process. Having trained outside of U.S., Dean Bryant-Friedrich stated that she knew many people well-versed in English. At the next GC meeting she would like to bring to floor for support the expanded list of countries presented today. She suggested that Council think about it and discuss within their units.

Information and Discussion Items

Research and Sponsored Programs Update

Dr. Frank Calzonetti reported that the Strategic Plan states that the university will identify five areas of research excellence. A couple already identified have a broad umbrella in biomedical research and energy and the environment (including water research). The process aims to drill down to identify where we can we advance our position as a research university. The University Research Council went through a call. We are starting with letter of intent. Want to look at first providing guidance of Research Council. The memo is being reviewed by Provost and President. Questions should be addressed to either Dr. Frank Calzonetti or Dr. Connie Schall in the Office of Research.

Standing Committees Update

There was no update.

Process for New Graduate Program Development

Dr. Cyndee Gruden provided a brief description and process outline of for the development of a new graduate program proposal. She asked that she be contacted to help graduate faculty through the process and provide examples. Historically the process through the State has been a two-step process, first with a program development plan (PDP) and second with a full proposal. Next year, they are not requiring the program development plan (PDP) in order to speed up the process. The State has an updated version of the guidelines but it is not yet posted.

The Full Proposal requires:

1. Degree, rationale, focus, purpose and significance.
2. Proposed curriculum.
3. Evidence of need including consideration of similar programs.
4. Prospective enrollment.
5. Efforts to enroll and retain underrepresented students.
6. Availability and adequacy of the faculty and facilities.
7. Projected costs including ODHE Fiscal Impact Statement (money coming in and costs to run the program).
Should be cost neutral or cost benefit.
8. Appendices containing faculty vitae, course descriptions, needs surveys, and consultants' reports.

The program proposal presented to the Graduate Council will be the same presentation to the Provost. The process will be posted to COGS website.

Standing Committee Reports

Report of the Curriculum Committee

On behalf of the Graduate Council Membership Committee (GCCC), Co-chair, Dr. Amy Thompson presented the following report. Council approved unanimously.

#	Proposal Type	Coll.	Department	Title	Course Number	Description
1	NCP	LS	Economics	Energy Economics	ECON 5280	New Course in Economics (4 Cr Hrs) The course focuses on the energy markets. There is a companion undergraduate (3 cr hr, 4280). The extra graduate hour is additional reading and using a software program "Stata". Prerequisites changed from Econ 1150 and Econ 1200 to "Enrollment in the Graduate Program". Course description grammar corrected and error in Rationale corrected (4000 level to 5000 level)
2	ECM	LS	Economics	Population Economics	ECON 5050	Course Modification in Economics (3 Cr Hrs changing to 4 hrs) The course focuses on the economics of demographics and population. The request is to add an additional contact hour. The undergraduate course is 4050 (3 hrs) which remains the same.

Old Business

Dean Bryant-Friedrich stated that she would continue Strategic Planning discussions at upcoming GC meetings. Graduate Education Strategic Planning should be done early next year so we can move to the preparation phase. She asked Council if the next discussion should focus on research and scholarship or fiscal positioning and infrastructure.

Dr. Mike Dowd suggested discussing fiscal positioning and infrastructure since it affects the decisions of discussions of everything else.

Dean Bryant-Friedrich said that she would discuss with Council how we build strong financial foundations, how to increase revenue, operating efficiency and improving infrastructure.

New Business

Doctoral Hooding Ceremony

Dr. Cyndee Gruden announced that COGS will host the University's first Doctoral Hooding Ceremony on Saturday, December 16th, 4:00 -5:30 pm, in Doermann Theater. This is meant to be a special, regal ceremony for our doctoral graduates. A former Ph.D. recipient from Biological Sciences at UT, Dr. Michelle Klingbeil, will be the keynote speaker. We are expecting 60-65 doctoral students to participate. Students will receive an email and RSVP. COGS is requesting support from graduate faculty to serve as marshals and usher. This ceremony is in addition to the university-wide ceremony on Sunday, December 17th. We hope that the doctoral graduates will also participate in the full ceremony. Degrees will be conferred at the full ceremony, but hooding will take place at the special ceremony on December 16th. They will come into the full ceremony already hooded.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 1:55 p.m.