

Graduate Council Minutes
March 19, 2013
12:30 – 2:00 p.m.
Main Campus, Student Union 2582

Present: Brian Ashburner, Barbaranne Benjamin, James Benjamin, David Black, Mary Ellen Edwards, Timothy Fisher, Max Funk, David Giovannucci, Paul Hong, Wayne Hoss, Junghwan Kim, Patricia Komuniecki, Anand Kunnathur, Sara Lundquist, Monica McKnight, Holly Monsos, Timothy Mueser, Surya Nauli, Douglas Nims, Rod Gabel (for Lori Pakulski), Nick Piazza, Susan Pocotte, Patricia Relue, Dorothea Sawicki, Constance Schall, Snejana Slatcheva-Durst, Susan Sochacki, William Taylor, Mark Templin, Gerard Thompson, Joshua Waldman.

Excused: Amanda Bryant-Friedrich, Charlene Gilbert, Kay Grothaus, Mohamed S. Hefzy, Ruth Ann Hottell, David Jex, Joseph Margiotta, Frank Pizza, Randall Ruch, Snejana Slantcheva-Durst, Cynthia Smas, Kandace Williams.

Absent: Renee Heberle, Rebecca Schneider, James Trempe, James Willey.

Guest: John Plenefisch.

Call to Order, Roll Call, and Approval of Minutes

The meeting was called to order and the roll called. The Minutes of the February 5, 2013 and February 19, 2013 minutes were approved.

Executive Reports

Report of the Executive Committee of the Graduate Council

Dr. Nick Piazza, Graduate Council (GC) Chair, reported that the Graduate Council Executive Committee (GCEC), as instructed by Graduate Council at the last meeting, crafted a letter of response to Provost Scarborough's workload policy. The GCEC collaborated with the Faculty Senate Executive Committee who was authorized by a vote of the Faculty Senate to endorse the letter as co-signatories. The letter was hand delivered to Drs. Jacobs, Scarborough, and Gold, as well as the Board of Trustees, on Thursday of last week. Copies were also distributed to the *Independent Collegian*, the *Toledo Blade*, the *Chronicle of Higher Education*, and *Inside Higher Education*. A copy of the letter was distributed via email through the Faculty Senate office to all faculty at the university. On Friday, it was discovered that there was an email transmission error with the attached letter had not been distributed to faculty. A second email with the letter attached was sent out on Friday and, again, faculty did not receive the email. Consequently, on Monday, Dr. Piazza sent an email out to Graduate Faculty with the letter attached. Dr. Piazza apologized to faculty for any delay.

Last night, Dr. Jacobs mailed out his response to the GCEC/FSEC letter and a copy of his response was forwarded to all graduate faculty. Dr. Jacob's letter indicated that he thought that discussion of the concerns raised should occur at University Council (UC). The GC is represented on the UC Executive Committee and we have considerable representation on the UC. Provost Scarborough had originally scheduled a discussion of the GC letter for the most recent UC meeting on Friday, March 15th. However, since the letter had not yet been distributed and faculty were unprepared for such a discussion, Dr. Piazza and Faculty Senate Chair, Mike Dowd, recommended that discussion be deferred until the next UC meeting on April 19th. Faculty representatives on the UC should now have enough time to study both the GC letter and Dr. Jacobs' response before discussion begins.

Another important item is the draft University Council charge for the Graduate and Professional Academic Programs Committee. The charge reads as follows:

The committee is to **study and report** on all matters of interest or concern regarding the graduate and professional academic programs of the university, including: development of new programs; and identifying areas for improvement in and suggested modifications to existing programs, and methods for measuring improvement. Specifically, the committee **will coordinate and work with existing University committees** considering similar or identical matters to determine the best course of action to allow efficient development and reporting of suggestions for ways to improve University's graduate and professional academic programs **while minimizing duplication of effort**. Such effort may result in the consolidation of one or more committees among themselves and/or with this committee.

The text in bold type reveals what Dr. Piazza believes to be the most important phrasing in the charge. First, the committee charge is to "study and report, ...coordinate and work with," and minimize "duplication of effort." The good news is that the committee is not charged with making decisions or recommendations in the areas that have traditionally been the portfolio of COGS, the GCEC, the Graduate Council, or any of the GC committees. This signifies that the seven core functions presented at our last meeting remain part of our portfolio. Just as a reminder, these seven functions are:

1. Recommend and advise on academic policy and standards to COGS.
2. Academic hearings: appeals, grievances.
3. Advise the GSA.
4. Review and approve new courses and programs; review and approve modifications/changes to existing courses and programs.
5. Advise and make recommendations to COGS regarding fellowships, scholarships, and other financial support for graduate students.
6. Review and approve applications for new and renewing graduate faculty.
7. Graduate program review.

As chair of the UC Graduate and Professional Academic Programs Committee, Dr. Piazza has been working with the chair of the Undergraduate Programs Committee to review areas and activities where we can harmonize policies, procedures, and practices. Our hope is to insure that we implement similar and complementary systems and avoid potential conflicts.

Dr. Piazza's goal for the UC Graduate and Professional Academic Programs Committee is that it not involve itself in the internal workings of any existing organizational structures. Rather, his vision for this committee is that it will facilitate interaction between existing graduate structures and wider university units that may be able to contribute to the success of graduate education at the university. An example would be to work with Student Affairs and the Finance Office to find more affordable health insurance for graduate students.

Another part of Dr. Piazza's vision for this committee is to identify where economies and efficiencies might be realized that could improve the delivery of graduate education and the graduate experience and make recommendations to that effect. An example of this sort of activity would be last year's successful attempt to recover graduate student fees for the GSA in partnership with COGS and the GSA.

Report of the Graduate Student Association (GSA)

Mr. Joshua Waldman, GSA President, reported that the Midwest Graduate Research Symposium (MGRS) scheduled for April 20, 2013 is coming along quite well. There are 75 individuals signed up who represent fourteen universities. Even though the number might seem low, he stated that 90% of those who registered last year did so within the week prior to the event.

Twelve judges (six of whom are from UT), have already signed up, but the GSA still needs additional judges. And Mr. Waldman would like to see a strong representation from the University of Toledo.

Mr. Waldman reported that the GSA is now able to offer supporting funds for recruiting efforts. He asked that those seeking further information please contact him or a GSA officer.

The GSA is in the process of launching a research award program entitled "GSA Research Award". The applications will be vetted by graduate faculty and graduate students on the GC Student Affairs Committee. An application should be made available soon on the GSA website. The tentative timeline is as follows:

Applications open March 29
Application deadline April 19
Winners announced April 30 (at last GC meeting)

Further, the GSA plans to launch a new website early next week which will be much more user-friendly.

Report of the Vice Provost for Graduate Affairs and Dean of the College of Graduate Studies

Dean Komuniecki provided the following updates:

- *Budget Update*

In late January, COGS was authorized to release 85% of the FY13 stipend and tuition scholarship funding to the academic colleges for FY14 to cover all the continuing graduate students across the board. During February, COGS prepared additional information for discussion with the Provost to better explain the distribution and utilization of GA funds for FY13. Dean Komuniecki was pleased to report that the Provost has indicated that COGS will have the same FY14 stipend and tuition scholarship budgets as FY13. The remainder of the 15% of the funding was allocated strategically to the academic colleges last week.

- *Admissions Updates*

As of March 11th, COGS has already processed 2,775 applications for fall 2013, and departments and programs have started admitting students, about 10% of the current applicant pool overall to date. Now that the GA budgets for FY14 have been released to the colleges, Dean Komuniecki encouraged graduate admissions committees to review applicant pools expeditiously so as to recruit a strong incoming class of students this fall.

- *University Council*

As previously reported, all colleges were contacted in January by Vice Provost John Barrett, who is serving as the Chair of the University Council, to provide their constitutions and bylaws. COGS submitted the Constitution and Bylaws of the Graduate Council, and referred them to the Graduate Student Association website to obtain their information. Late last week, COGS was contacted by Ms. Beth Hagen, on behalf of John Barrett, to make some revisions that would be consistent with the existence of this new entity. COGS will work with the Graduate Council Constitution and Bylaws Committee to try to comply with the request to have revisions back to University Council by April 8th or as soon as possible thereafter before the end of spring term. In addition, the GSA documents will also need to be in compliance by that date.

- *Strengthening Pathways for Higher Education into Careers Event*

Next Monday, March 25th, Dean Komuniecki will be representing UT at a special one-day event sponsored by The Ohio State University with the Council of Graduate Schools, Battelle, Case Western Reserve University and the Business Higher Education Forum. This event will bring together graduate deans from across Ohio with corporate and industrial partners and policy makers to discuss how we can all work together to meet Ohio's needs for a highly skilled and educated workforce. Dr. Debra Stewart, CGS President, and Mr. Jeffrey Wadsworth, CEO at Battelle, are two of the panelists.

Dean Komuniecki will bring back information to Graduate Council at its next meeting which might also be a good time to share the 10-minute video that the joint Commission of CGS and ETS produced last April about this same topic (Pat Osmer, Dean of the OSU Graduate School was a co-chair of that commission). Discussion ensued about the possibility of obtaining corporate funding or endowments for graduate schools. Dean Komuniecki reported that currently there are 46 students receiving funding from companies. The number varies each year but it is typically between 35-45 and the 2011 number is the highest figure to date since the inception of this program in 2008.

- *Research Compliance for Graduate Students*

Dean Komuniecki reminded Graduate Council of the importance of RCR (Responsible Conduct of Research) training for all graduate students, as well as undergraduate students, fellows and faculty supported by federal funds from the National Science Foundation (NSF) and the National Institutes of Health (NIH). UT has contracted with the Collaborative Institutional Training Initiative (CITI) to provide online RCR training modules in several disciplinary categories: Arts and Humanities, Biological/Biomedical Sciences, Engineering Sciences, Social and Behavioral Sciences and the Physical Sciences. Anyone supported by NSF must complete the appropriate module and the documentation verifying that that training has been completed. Additional information about CITI Training and RCR can be found on the Office of Research and Sponsored Programs website.

Further, NIH also requires that NIH funded investigators and their groups must also have RCR training that involves “substantial face to face discussions” and to fulfill that requirement, NIH funded personnel must take the course offered on the HSC “On Becoming a Scientist” (INDI602/802) coordinated by Dr. Randy Ruch. A separate course is offered for undergraduates (ARS2980) coordinated by Dr. Tom Kvale. As part of graduate education it is really important to make sure our graduate students are fully aware of this. Ms. Terri Hayes will be sending the graduate faculty a link to this website.

- *Fellowships, Scholarships and Awards*

Dean Komuniecki was pleased to announce that there was an excellent response to our recent solicitation for a variety of special fellowship and awards supported by COGS. COGS received 27 University Fellowship applications, 24 applications for the Robert N. Whiteford Memorial Scholarship, 8 for the Robert R. Buell Memorial Achievement Award, and 3 for the Helen M. Fields Memorial Achievement Award. These applications are currently under review by the GC Fellowships and Scholarships Committee and which will meet Thursday, March 21st to make decisions. In addition, COGS received 33 Graduate Opportunity Assistantship Program (GOAP) applications that will be reviewed by the COGS Diversity Committee, chaired by Associate Dean Susan Pocotte, next week. Lastly, COGS also had a great pool of applicants for the Ronald E. McNair Scholar award this year. Dean Komuniecki will report to Council about the outcomes of all these awards at an upcoming GC meeting, and the Whiteford, Buell and Fields award recipients will be recognized at our last GC meeting on April 30th.

- *Information Item: “America Invents Act”*

The Office of Research and Sponsored Programs (RSP) wants to be sure that everyone is aware of the recent enactment on March 16, 2013 of the “America Invents Act”. This essentially provides that the first inventor to file a patent application, regardless of dates of invention, will own the rights to the invention. So, investigators at UT are encouraged to disclose new discoveries as soon as possible with the UT RSP. Additional information can be obtained from Mr. Mark Fox, Patent Technology Associate in the RSP office.

- *Announcements*

- *Professional Development Programs:*

The penultimate program of the year will be offered this afternoon in Carlson Library 1027 from 3:00-5:00 p.m. and is entitled “Writing in the STEM Disciplines: Why Engineers *Should* Write Well”.

o *Spring Commencements*

There will be multiple commencements this spring to accommodate the large number of anticipated graduates. COGS has been asked to provide readers and marshals for the Ceremonies in Savage Arena on Sunday, May 5, 2013.

- The morning ceremony at 9:30 a.m. will include the Colleges of Business and Innovation, Natural Sciences and Mathematics, Visual and Performing Arts, and Languages, Literature and Social Sciences.
- The afternoon ceremony at 2:00 p.m. will include the Judith Herb College of Education, Health Science and Human Service, and Adult and Lifelong Learning.
- GC Chair, Dr. Nick Piazza has offered to serve as the reader at both ceremonies, but we would like to invite members of Council to serve as marshals since at least two are needed for each ceremony. Please notify Ms. Terri Hayes if you are able to volunteer.
- For your information, the College of Engineering will hold its graduate convocation/commencement on Friday, May 3rd at 5:00 p.m. The College of Nursing will hold its convocation/commencement earlier that day at 1:00 p.m. in Savage Arena. The College of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences will hold its convocation/commencement on Saturday, May 4th at 2:00 p.m. in Savage Arena.

Information and Discussion Items

Graduate and Professional Academic Committee of University Council—Implications for UC Constitution

Dr. Piazza presented the current UC charge to the Graduate and Professional Academic Committee of the screen for discussion and reminded the GC that Vice Chair David Giovannucci also serves on that UC committee. He stated that GC has been asked to suggest recommendations regarding this University Council committee charge. A suggestion offered was that the UC committee should not involve itself in Graduate Council Membership Committee, Curriculum Committee, and the other committees of Graduate Council. Questions arose regarding the function of this UC committee. Dr. Mark Templin shared that the use of “committee” in Roberts’ Rules of Order is defined as “a deliberative body of the assembly.” A GC member asked for clarification of the words in boldface font in the committee charge. Dr. Piazza indicated that the emphasis was his. Another question was raised about having separate UC committees for undergraduate and graduate programs as programs are linked and are difficult to discuss separately. Discussion ensued and Dean Komuniecki clarified that for the purposes of program review, both undergraduate and graduate programs would be considered together, but indicated that for the purposes of UC business, it was appropriate to have specific committees for undergraduate and graduate areas. Concern was shared about the last sentence of the charge—is there a better phrase to use in place of “university committees“. The phrase “University governance structures and committees” was suggested and there was general agreement that that phrase might be suitable. Dr. Piazza noted that the actual core functions of Graduate Council are not explicitly stated in the GC Constitution, but that they will be reflected in the minutes of this meeting. He recommended that GC integrate those core functions into the GC Constitution during the upcoming review process and noted further that the constitutions of all UT organizations and administrative bodies need to be reviewed to include reference to the new University Council.

Dr. Piazza initiated a discussion about the ‘delegation clause’ that the UC wishes to have included in all constitutions. He said that it presents an interesting situation for entities like GC since the GC Academic Standing Committee can hear academic grievances from students. He posed the question that if the delegation of authority comes from the administration, then does the Academic Standing Committee become “administrative” and not academic, thus opening up the possibility that a student could sue if they were dissatisfied with the outcome of the grievance process. Dean Komuniecki indicated that she has consulted with attorneys and they indicate that that possibility is remote.

Another concern was raised with the delegation clause to wit: if authority comes from the Board of Trustees (BOT) through the President to the Provost to University Council, then is the GC Chair no longer able to talk directly with the BOT? Is asking to talk to the BOT a violation? Concern was expressed about the role and function of the UC and that it will be important to ensure that no abuses of power arise. Dr. Piazza used a states right vs. federal rights analogy to try to explain how he thought that UC would work with other bodies. Further, he thought that UC could play a useful role when there were issues impacting graduate students from other areas on campus. UC could be an environment for GC to make a case to other entities not normally directly involved, but who could assist us in making a case for a major issue. For example, the GSA budget issue last year.

To assist the discussion, Dean Komuniecki provided the exact wording of the ‘delegation clause’ as follows: “The authority and power of the (insert name of organization) to make the actions set forth herein have been delegated and, in the ordinary course of events, will continue to be delegated from the Board of Trustees through the President and Officers of the University to the (insert name of organization).” Further, she mentioned that she had spoken directly with Vice Provost John Barrett, Chair of University Council, and he had indicated that Graduate Council and Faculty Senate should continue to work as they currently do; there is no plan to duplicate all the academic and membership processes of the GC but he views UC more of a receiving body to facilitate communication between the BOT and the faculty. Dr. Piazza agreed with that perspective.

Dean Komuniecki reassured GC that the ‘delegation clause’ is simply a statement of the current policy by which the BOT authorizes the President, who then authorizes the Provost and Chancellor, as officers of the University, to delegate responsibility to certain organizations, like GC for graduate matters and FS for undergraduate and other matters. Dr. Piazza requested that any further comments from the GC could be emailed to him.

Standing Committee Reports

Report of the Curriculum Committee – Dr. John Plenefisch

On behalf of the Graduate Council Curriculum Committee (GCCC) Dr. John Plenefisch, committee chair, reported that the GCCC reviewed and approved the following curriculum. Council approved unanimously.

PROGRAM REVISIONS

College	Department	Program	Summary of change
EH	Criminal Justice and Social Work	Social Work Program (a set of three related proposals that are to be looked at as a group, each one describes a single change, however the revised curriculum will contain all three changes)	1) Specifies the credits to be taken in the advanced internship courses SOWC 6900 and 6910 as 5 each. 2) Increases the number of weeks and hours the student is required to be in an internship within the semester in order to assure that the student has sufficient opportunity to master the field competencies and practice behaviors. 3) Clarifies the total number of required number of internship hours and the pre- and co-requisites in accordance to the MSW program curriculum.
EH	Accounting	Masters of Science in Accounting	ACCT 6310 and ACCT 6430 are no longer required courses, ACCT 6430 and ACCT 6960 are replaced by new courses ACCT 6440 and ACCT 6450

NEW COURSES

College	Department	Course Name	Course Number	Course Description
BU	Accounting	Advanced Auditing	ACCT 6440	Advanced Auditing aims to extend students' knowledge on auditing learnt from lower level auditing course (i.e. ACCT 4420/5420)
BU	Accounting	Fraud and Forensic Accounting	ACCT 6450	This course is designed to introduce the student to the basic concepts of Fraud Examination and Forensic Accounting
PH	Medicinal and Biological Chemistry	Advanced Synthetic and Medicinal Chemistry	MBC 6450	Readings in and critical analysis of recent literature in synthetic and medicinal chemistry research
PH	Medicinal and Biological Chemistry	Advanced Synthetic and Medicinal Chemistry	MBC 8450	Same as MBC 6450, Students in enrolled in the PhD course are expected to analyze literature, describe reaction mechanisms, and present at a higher level than those enrolled in the MS course.

COURSE MODIFICATIONS

College	Department	Course Name	Course Number	Change in course
BU	Accounting	Auditing	ACCT 5420	Change Alpha Code
BU	Accounting	External Financial Reporting III	ACCT 6130	Change prerequisite from C or higher in ACCT 4120 to C or higher in ACCT 3120
BU	Accounting	International Accounting and Taxation	ACCT 6150	Change ACCT 6210 from prerequisite to co-requisite
BU	Accounting	Research in Accounting and Taxation	ACCT 6210	Change in prerequisite course from ACCT 4120 to ACCT 3120, other prerequisites are unchanged
BU	Accounting	Taxation of Business Entities	ACCT 6250	Change in course title (from Corporate Taxation), in Alpha code from 6220 to 6250, in prerequisites from C or higher in ACCT 6210 to C or higher in both ACCT 3210 and ACCT 3120, add cross listing with ACCT 4250*, change in catalog description, change in content
BU	Accounting	Advanced Managerial Accounting	ACCT 6370	Change prerequisite from C or higher in ACCT 4310 to C or higher in ACCT 3320
BU	Accounting	Governmental and Not-for-Profit Accounting	ACCT 6410	Change prerequisite from C or higher in ACCT 3110 to C or higher in ACCT 3120
BU	Accounting	Business Valuation and Analysis	ACCT 6430	Change prerequisite from C or higher in ACCT 4120 to C or higher in ACCT 3120
LS	Economics	Applied Environmental Econ.	ECON 5240	Credit hours change from 3 to 4, graduate level content is expanded for graduate students taking this class that is cross listed with ECON 4240 **

* Graduate level students are required to complete a research paper that is not required of undergraduates in ACCT 4250
** GCCC recommendation for approval is contingent on clarification of difference in credits/content.

Report of the Membership Committee

None.

Report of the Bylaws Committee

None.

Old Business

None.

New Business

None.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the Council adjourned at 2:04 p.m.